

Opinions expressed here are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the Empire State Stem Cell Board, the New York State Department of Health, or the State of New York.

### HeLa Cells & HPV Genes: Immortality & Cancer Personal Policy Position Paper Rubric

Remember to view the prompts/ questions in the Case study Assignment

		Developing	Proficient	Exemplary
<b>Position on Biobanks Supported by Public Funding</b> <i>What do you propose? What are the Alternatives?</i> <i>What should accompany funding proposals?</i> <i>Health registry, recruitment guidelines, compensation, ban, caps, etc</i>	5	Position and perspective unclear	Position and perspective is clear	Clear position and perspective; relative to other stakeholders
<b>Evidence: Social Values</b> <i>How do policies and practices pose risk or benefit to society? What does society value and how is this represented in approaches based on altruism, compensation, or payment?</i>	10	Very little address of societal values, and lack of clarity regarding distributive and participatory justice	Addresses what society values and the ways this aligns with the distribution of benefits, risks and trade-offs in society	Provides concrete evidence and examples of how particular practices reflect social values and the distribution of benefits, risks, and trade-offs, and relating this to distributive and participatory justice issues
<b>Evidence: Science</b> <i>How do policies and practices pose risk or benefit to scientific research? How can policy influence the quality and quantity of the biospecimens collected?</i>	10	Assumes value in pursuing biobanking but does not detail the risks, benefits, and trade offs involved in providing biological resources for scientific and health research.	Supports biobanking but does not clarify risk or benefit to society if publicly or privately supported; inadequate address of diversity in banks for scientific investigations.	Compares the scientific and therapeutic potential biobanking and clarifies the benefits, risks, and trade offs for society if pursued through public or private efforts. Addresses genetic diversity in private and public cell lines and banks and the impact on scientific findings, and explains the connection to participatory and distributive justice.

<b>Evidence: Policy &amp; Activism</b> <i>Trajectory of past and present policies and movements designed to promote research and protect research subjects.</i>	10	Mention of legislation, policies, reports, or activist movements, but impact is not entirely clear	Some mention of laws, executive orders, lawsuits, or regulatory bodies, regarding bodily tissues and cell research, but little address of efforts to challenge those that are in place and some lack of connection or cross talk among them	Mention of multiple laws, specific policies, executive orders, and lawsuits by name and connects this back to social values; refers to the organization, bodies, groups that regulate biospecimen provision, cell research, and public health research and the connections among them as well as why they are being passed or challenged.
<b>Informed Consent &amp; Ethics</b> <i>Specifically addresses the challenges of obtaining informed consent in a changing landscape.</i>	10	Mentions informed consent in the research and clinical setting, but does not elaborate on the challenges associated with the process	Discusses informed consent in the context of securing biomaterials from healthy subjects and patients	Discusses the challenges in acquiring informed consent in the context of gathering biomaterials in a clinical setting versus and open access situation such as ResearchKit, or through programs such as newborn blood spots, or national biobanks.
<b>Health</b> <i>Addresses the risks and benefits of investing in the biomedical and/or social models of public health.</i>	10	Addresses the risks and/or benefits of only one model (biomedical or social) with little mention of the unique benefits and drawbacks of biobanking	Addresses risks and benefits of using either model of health. Addresses the kinds of disability and disease best suited for biobank related research and some mention of vulnerable groups.	Addresses risks and benefits of using either model of health. Addresses the kinds of disability and disease best suited for biobank related research and specifically addresses diversity and vulnerable population challenges and how they relate to allocations for funding and study design within the context of participatory and distributive justice.
<b>Counter Argument: Risks and Benefits</b> <i>Who benefits and who carries burden or risk</i> <i>Legal or historical precedent</i>	1 5	Acknowledges opposition	Presents specific opposition to stance; provides some evidence and example for opposition	Presents specific opposition to stance; provides concrete evidence and example of the opposing viewpoint
<b>Rebuttal Risks and Benefits</b> <i>Who benefits and who carries burden or risk</i> <i>Legal or historical precedent</i>	1 5	Does not address opposing viewpoint or arguments	Argues against one specific opposition with some evidence and example	Provides concrete evidence and examples to argue against the opposing viewpoint

<b>Writing Style:</b> Academic Argumentative Essay	10	Writing/flow of ideas needs improvement; grammatical/spelling errors.	Writing is clear & focused; flow of argument could be improved; no grammatical/spelling errors	Writing is clear, engaging, with good flow of theme and logic. No grammatical or spelling errors
<b>Citations and Bibliography:</b> At LEAST FIVE citations to course resources should be cited and included in the bibliography	5	Few references and/ or citation errors.	Bibliography draws from case resources & correct citations	Rich bibliography drawing from many course resources & correct citations.